# Data Appendix for "Estimating Cross-Country Differences in Product Quality"\*

Peter K. Schott $^{\ddagger}$ Yale School of Management & NBER

First Version: July 2005
This Version: December 2007

### Abstract

This Data Appendix provides additional information on how the datasets for the abovereferenced paper are constructed. It also reports the full set of quality index intercepts and slopes, as well as their standard errors, by country and industry.

Keywords: Export Unit Values; Export Quality; Revealed Preference; Vertical Differentiation; Horizontal Differentiation

JEL classification: F1; F2; F4

<sup>\*</sup>This research is supported by the National Science Foundation under Grants No. 0241474 and 0550190. Any opinions, findings, and conclusions or recommendations expressed in this material are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the National Science Foundation.

 $<sup>^\</sup>dagger \text{Vito Dumas 284, (B1644BID)}$  Buenos Aires, Argentina, tel: (5411) 4725-7081, fax: (5411) 4725-7010, email: jchallak@udesa.edu.ar

 $<sup>^{\</sup>ddagger}135$  Prospect Street, New Haven, CT 06520, tel: (203) 436-4260, fax: (203) 432-6974, email: peter.schott@yale.edu

#### 1. Introduction

This Data Appendix provides additional information related to the results reported in "Estimating Cross-Country Differences in Product Quality". Section 2 discusses issues related to dataset construction. Section 3 reports estimated Quality Index intercepts and slopes by country and industry, along with their standard errors.

## 2. Dataset Construction

### 2.1. Net Trade

We use trade data from the United Nations Commodity Trade Statistics Database (COMTRADE) to construct global trade balances for each country during the sample period.<sup>1</sup> Trade balances are computed for overall manufacturing, by one-digit SITC manufacturing industry, and for Textiles (two-digit SITC 65) and Apparel (two-digit SITC 84).

Records in the COMTRADE data track reporting countries' bilateral trade flows with each of their partner countries by industry and year. Our approach is to subtract each country's total reported imports from its total reported exports by industry and year.<sup>2</sup> Here, we note substantial caveats and adjustments. Our exact algorithm for refining the trade data can be found by examining the Stata programs used to construct the trade balances.

- Missing data. One-year gaps in reporting (i.e. the absence of data for imports, exports or both in a particular country-year) occur in a number of countries that otherwise exhibit regular reporting. All of the reports for Japan and Pakistan, for example, are missing for 1992 and 1994, respectively. Short gaps in trade reporting were interpolated from the closest years available.
- CIF versus FOB: Imports are reported CIF while exports are reported FOB.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>COMTRADE data are revised over time. The data described here were accessed on June 8, 2006 via the website http://unstats.un.org/unsd/comtrade.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>Unfortunately, country pairs' reported trade flows with each other are often mutually inconsistent. Since our principal interest is the accuracy of countries' overall net trade with the world, we favor this approach, which maximizes reporting consistency within countries, to the one taken by Feenstra et al. (1997, 2000), which generally relies on reporting countries' import statistics to estimate bilateral trade flows.

Exports are adjusted by an estimated year-sector-country-pair transport cost spread.

- Entrepôt trade. Hong-Kong and Singapore act as entrepôts for exports from China and Malaysia, respectively. In COMTRADE data, countries importing goods from either China or Malaysia via Hong-Kong or Singapore attribute the entire value of the import to the country of origin, although value is added by the entrepôt. Reports from both exporting countries in turn reflect this addition of value: exports from the country of origin (entrepôt) to the final destination are lower (higher) than reported by the country of destination. To avoid error in origin attribution, we assign preference to reports from Hong-Kong, Singapore, China and Malaysia over those of other countries in exports as well as imports.
- COMTRADE does not include Taiwanese trade data. Taiwan is excluded from COMTRADE. We identify Taiwanese trade from flows reported by all countries in the database in which the partner is classified under UN code 490 ("other Asia, not elsewhere specified"), which reporting countries generally use to classify trade with Taiwan. However, given countries' standard practice of reporting imports under the "country-of-origin" criterion noted above, employing partner reports in this manner would lead to double counting of Taiwan's exports to areas in which there is entrepôt trade. A Taiwanese export that passes through customs in Singapore and is later re-exported to Malaysia, for example, would be registered by both countries as an import from UN code 490. To avoid double counting, we employ Taiwan's own data of exports to the People's Republic of China, Hong Kong, Malaysia, Indonesia and Singapore, downloaded from Taiwan's Bureau of Foreign Trade (eweb.trade.gov.tw).
- Missing reports of Singapore's trade with Indonesia. Singapore does not report any trade with Indonesia on COMTRADE prior to 2003, even though Indonesia is one of its main trade partners. We employ the ratio of Singapore and Indonesia's trade reports for a same trade flow in 2003 and 2004 to create sector-specific adjustment factors. We proxy Singapore's missing trade reports as Indonesia's factor-adjusted reports up to 2002.
- Unspecified origin. Imports reported to originate in general unspecified areas

- i.e., "bunkers" (UN code 837), "free zones" (838), "special categories" (839) and "areas not elsewhere specified" (899) are attributed to partners reporting exports in excess of specified import value. For a country-year-sector in which unidentified imports are greater than the sum of bilateral gaps between specified imports and partner exports, the entire value of unidentified imports is allocated to close the gaps, and any remainder kept as unspecified imports. Where unspecified imports are insufficient to close all gaps, unspecified imports are distributed across partners in proportion to gap value. Exports to unspecified areas are not attributed: because a reporter's fob export value should always be below partners' cif values there is no natural basis for attribution.
- Non-ferrous metals. Following standard practice, we remove non-ferrous metals (two-digit SITC 68) from manufactured goods. Products in this category are generally considered commodities. We note that removing trade values at the two-digit level from one-digit data is non-trivial because quality in reporting degrades with disaggregation. We proxy for gaps in reporting because otherwise the construction of bilateral trade flows in one-digit SITC 6 would employ data from different directions of trade when netting imports in two-digit SITC 68. In a number of cases, that would lead to substantial mismatches. A gap in the two-digit record of a given country A with partner B is adjusted if it meets three conditions: i) country A reports a flow from B under one-digit SITC code 6 but not under two-digit code 68, ii) A reports a flow of non-ferrous metals from B in the same direction of trade for some other year during the period, and iii) B claims the existence of the flow in that particular year. We construct an average ratio of flows in two-digit SITC 68 to flows in one-digit SITC 6 for the country pair. To proxy A's report at two-digits, we adjust its one-digit reported value by this average ratio. The average ratio is obtained from the two years surrounding the missing data. If a ratio was unavailable from either surrounding year, the ratio from the other was used. If a ratio in both surrounding years was unavailable, ratios from the closest years available were used.

#### 2.2. Trade Costs

Tariff information comes from the Trade Analysis and Information System (TRAINS) Database maintained by the United Nations Conference on Trade and Development (UNCTAD). Using the World Integrated Trade Solution (WITS) internet interface, we download publicly available data on reporting countries' most favored nation (MFN) and bilateral preferential (PRF) tariff rates for pooled manufacturing goods as well as for manufacturing goods by one-digit SITC industry and select two-digit SITC industries (see main text).<sup>3</sup>

Countries assign tariffs according to six- to ten-digit Harmonized System product classifications. Here, we make use of UNCTAD-constructed weighted average tariff rates computed across all tariff lines available for pooled manufacturing and for manufacturing by one-digit SITC industry and for select two-digit SITC industries. These weighted average tariffs use reporting countries' import values as weights.<sup>4</sup>

Unfortunately, the tariff data are available only sparsely. Table 1, for example, reports MFN data availability for pooled manufacturing across the countries in our sample, where EUN refers to the countries of the European Union. Each cell of the table either contains the reporter's weighted average MFN tariff or is missing (i.e., "."). As indicated in the table, MFN data is available for just under half of the cells. Data availability for one-digit manufacturing industries as well as for bilateral preferential tariffs is similarly limited.

Our construct of a trade-cost dataset has three steps. First, we construct a balanced panel of MFN tariffs for both pooled manufacturing and for one-digit manufacturing industries. In both cases, we use the following algorithm. Start with the raw data from TRAINS. Fill in missing reporter-year (MFN) observations by using data for the last year available. For example, if country c reports a pooled-manufacturing MFN tariff of 10 percent in 1995 and 8 percent in 2000, we assume it has pooledmanufacturing MFN tariffs of 10 percent and 8 percent for years 1995 to 1999 and for 2000 to 2004, respectively. Missing observations before the first year of data

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup>The data can be accessed at http://wits.worldbank.org via Microsoft's Internet Explorer after installing the WITS software (http://wits.worldbank.org/install.htm) and registering with the World Bank. For MFN tariffs, we use reporting countries MFN tariff vis a vis the world. For PRF tariffs, we use the preferential tariffs countries report separately for each partner country.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup>We do not observe changes in the set of tariff lines used to construct these averages across either time or country pairs. As a result, they are likely influenced by composition.

Country	1989	1990	1991	1992	1993	1994	1995	1996	1997	1998	1999	2000	2001	2002	2003
ARG				14	14		12	14	15	16	15	15	14	13	14
AUS			12		10			5	5	5	5	5	4	5	5
AUT		11													
BRA	37	28	23	21	16	16	14	16	16	18	16	15	12	12	12
CAN	8				8		7	5	5	4	3	3	3	3	3
CHE		0			0		0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
CHL				11	11	11	11		11	11	10	9	8	7	
CHN				36	33	30		18	15	15	14	13	13		7
COL			6	10		11	12	11	11		10	11	10	11	
EUN	6	7	7	7	7	7	6	5	5	4	3	3	3	4	4
FIN															
HKG										0					
HUN			12		10			9	9					8	
IDN	15	16			14		13	9			8	7	5	6	6
IND		71		44					21		32		28		
ISR					5										
JPN	4	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
KOR	13	11		10			7	8			6			5	
MAR					55				18			26	26	26	25
MEX			13				12		12	12	15	15	14	15	14
MYS			11		9			6	6	-			5	5	5
NOR					6		6	5		2		2	2	1	1
NZL				10	9			8	6	5	5	4		5	5
PAK							49			44			21	18	17
PHL	23	15		15	15	15	14			6	6	4	3	2	2
POL				11			10	13	10	10	9	10	8	8	8
ROM			18								14		15		
SGP	1						0						0	0	0
SWE	5														
THA	35		34		37		16					10	11		11
TUR					8		7		6		5				5
TWN	11			6				4			5	3	3	3	3
ZAF		11	12		14			9	6		5		6		

Notes: Table displays mean weighted average MFN tariff by reporting country and year. "." denotes data unavailability. EUN denotes European Union countries.

Table 1: MFN Data Availability in the TRAINS Dataset, 1989 to 2003

availability are filled in with the next available observation.

Second, we construct a similar panel of preferential tariffs but omit the final step, i.e., we do not assume preferential tariffs exist before the first year they show up in TRAINS. Our assumption is that preferential tariffs are most likely to appear around the time they are introduced or changed, and casual analysis of the data appears consistent with this assumption.<sup>5</sup>

Third, fill in a complete bilateral database for years 1989 to 2003 using the constructed MFN dataset described above. Then, using the constructed PRF dataset just described, replace the MFN tariff with a PRF tariff if it is available.<sup>6</sup> The final dataset, therefore, contains a mixture of MFN and PRF tariff rates under the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup>The preferential tariffs associated with Mercosur, for example, first show up in 1995.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup>We keep the MFN tariff in the small number of cases in which the MFN tariff is lower than the PRF tariff.

assumption that the country pair is governed by MFN rules if preferential rates do not appear in TRAINS. These tariff rates are combined with the estimated transport costs described in the main text to compute the structural trade cost parameters used in the estimation.

Our trade barrier data have three known weaknesses. First, they are available for less than half of the reporter-partner-year cells in our sample period. As a result, we must impute a large number of MFN and PRF tariffs using neighboring values. Second, due to changes in product categorization over time as well as uneven reporting of tariffs across countries and years, the weighted-average tariff rates we rely upon are based upon a non-constant mix of products, introducing potential composition bias. Finally, the TRAINS data do not provide meaningful information about countries' non-tariff barriers, such as apparel and textile quotas.

# 2.3. Real Exchange Rates

To fill in the missing EIU data, we normalize the World Bank data to the EIU data in overlap years and use the WB data for years missing in the EIU dataset. Comparisons of the series in the overlap years indicate a relatively close match and are available upon request. RER data for any remaining holes in the dataset are computed using raw nominal exchange rate and CPI deflator data available in the International Financial Statistics published by the IMF. These data are available at www.imf.org.

## 3. Quality Index Intercepts and Slopes

Tables 2, 3 and 4 report the Quality Index intercepts and slopes for each country in the sample for All Manufacturing, one-digit SITC sectors 5, 6, 7, and 8, and two-digit SITC sectors 65, 84, and 65+84. Intercepts and slopes are obtained from the second stage of the estimation.

_	Quality	Intercept	Quality	Slope
Country	Coeff	StdErr	Coeff	StdErr
Argentina (ARG)	-0.097	0.005	-0.002	0.004
Australia (AUS)	0.230	0.066	-0.033	0.004
Austria (AUT)	0.453	0.008	-0.017	0.000
Belgium (BEL)	0.507	0.076	0.001	0.001
Brazil (BRA)	-0.138	0.045	-0.014	0.006
Canada (CAN)	0.135	0.030	-0.024	0.002
Switzerland (CHE)	0.855	0.031	-0.011	0.002
Chile (CHL)	-0.749	0.111	0.022	0.001
China (CHN)	-0.418	0.035	-0.008	0.002
Colombia (COL)	-0.379	0.034	-0.010	0.004
Germany (DEU)	0.723	0.070	-0.024	0.001
Denmark (DNK)	0.501	0.014	-0.018	0.002
Spain (ESP)	0.239	0.004	-0.021	0.003
Finland (FIN)	0.622	0.048	-0.001	0.004
France (FRA)	0.642	0.028	-0.019	0.002
UK (GBR)	0.470	0.012	-0.020	0.003
Greece (GRC)	-0.450	0.076	0.000	0.004
Hong Kong (HKG)	0.137	0.081	-0.037	0.007
Hungary (HUN)	-0.220	0.027	0.033	0.003
Indonesia (IDN)	-0.547	0.033	0.024	0.007
India (IND)	-0.399	0.061	-0.008	0.005
Ireland (IRL)	0.521	0.019	0.076	0.017
Israel (ISR)	0.185	0.031	-0.006	0.003
Italy (ITA)	0.623	0.063	-0.016	0.002
Japan (JPN)	0.479	0.071	-0.021	0.003
Korea (KOR)	0.076	0.070	0.003	0.002
Morocco (MAR)	-0.599	0.043	0.021	0.002
Mexico (MEX)	-0.320	0.006	-0.005	0.002
Malaysia (MYS)	-0.696	0.104	0.066	0.020
Netherlands (NLD)	0.244	0.008	0.000	0.000
Norway (NOR)	0.236	0.075	0.002	0.003
New Zealand (NZL)	0.095	0.092	-0.034	0.003
Pakistan (PAK)	-0.738	0.020	0.014	0.001
Philippines (PHL)	-0.694	0.095	0.043	0.010
Poland (POL)	-0.469	0.020	-0.001	0.008
Portugal (PRT)	-0.016	0.031	-0.002	0.003
Romania (ROM)	-0.581	0.067	0.009	0.010
Singapore (SGP)	-0.007	0.023	0.055	0.018
Sweden (SWE)	0.796	0.049	-0.018	0.001
Thailand (THA)	-0.649	0.082	0.018	0.008
Turkey (TUR)	-0.336	0.011	-0.003	0.003
Taiwan (TWN)	0.133	0.130	-0.021	0.004
South Africa (ZAF)	-0.400	0.038	0.006	0.002

Notes: Columns display estimated quality fixed effect and time trend from 2SLS estimation of equation (37) relative to their respective means across all countries in the sample. Standard errors are heteroskedasticity-robust and adjusted for clustering at the country level. Country codes noted in parentheses next to country names.

Table 2: Quality Index Intercepts and Slopes for All Manufacturing

				Inte	ercept								ре			
	5-Che	micals	6-Man	uf Mat	7-Mac	hinery	8-Misc	Manuf	5-Che	micals	6-Man	uf Mat	7-Mac	hinery	8-Misc	Manuf
Country	Coeff	StdErr	Coeff	StdErr	Coeff	StdErr	Coeff	StdErr	Coeff	StdErr	Coeff	StdErr	Coeff	StdErr	Coeff	StdErr
ARG	-0.249	0.121	-0.121	0.015	0.197	0.026	-0.311	0.188	-0.029	0.125	0.003	0.003	-0.004	0.011	0.002	0.002
AUS	0.369	0.402	0.091	0.040	0.529	0.089	-0.003	0.296	-0.032	0.110	-0.004	0.001	-0.072	0.013	-0.017	0.004
AUT	0.004	0.305	0.376	0.061	0.469	0.016	0.225	0.383	0.017	0.067	0.000	0.002	-0.034	0.002	-0.004	0.008
BEL	0.128	1.340	0.440	0.126	0.844	0.143	-0.142	0.336	0.016	0.115	-0.007	0.003	-0.041	0.011	0.031	0.013
BRA	-0.399	0.351	-0.092	0.048	-0.113	0.115	-0.478	0.133	0.003	0.168	-0.011	0.003	-0.017	0.015	-0.007	0.002
CAN	-0.047	0.350	-0.014	0.022	0.363	0.060	-0.260	0.326	-0.031	0.134	0.001	0.002	-0.049	0.008	-0.009	0.004
CHE	0.682	2.610	0.934	0.029	0.888	0.083	0.601	0.130	0.006	0.032	-0.003	0.002	-0.058	0.010	0.014	0.008
CHL			-0.512	0.050			-0.780	0.266			0.020	0.000			-0.002	0.009
CHN	-0.490	0.408	-0.580	0.028	-1.154	0.095	0.157	0.432	-0.016	0.088	-0.005	0.002	0.004	0.006	0.014	0.012
COL			-0.128	0.001			-0.412	0.020			-0.007	0.002	-	-	-0.014	0.011
DEU	0.290	1.461	0.324	0.024	1.151	0.226	0.334	0.243	-0.006	0.076	-0.006	0.001	-0.043	0.005	-0.016	0.004
DNK	0.061	0.191	0.405	0.026	0.949	0.083	0.345	0.055	0.006	0.023	-0.031	0.001	-0.056	0.012	0.014	0.000
ESP	-0.132	0.286	0.158	0.009	0.320	0.043	-0.004	0.236	-0.008	0.102	-0.006	0.001	-0.029	0.009	-0.009	0.002
FIN	-0.103	0.420	0.430	0.160	0.736	0.018	0.676	0.264	0.025	0.067	0.012	0.003	0.007	0.009	-0.048	0.003
FRA	0.183	0.760	0.372	0.015	0.808	0.103	0.552	0.245	0.003	0.062	-0.001	0.001	-0.044	0.006	-0.013	0.000
GBR	0.037	0.782	0.252	0.012	0.731	0.076	0.169	0.220	0.013	0.085	0.003	0.001	-0.049	0.011	-0.019	0.004
GRC			-0.068	0.058			-0.600	0.106			-0.015	0.001			0.014	0.015
HKG	-0.544	1.643	-0.564	0.167	-0.703	0.060	3.426	2.160	0.011	0.025	-0.002	0.006	-0.044	0.016	-0.125	0.066
HUN			-0.108	0.014	-0.962	0.166	-0.195	0.048			0.004	0.008	0.106	0.015	0.020	0.008
IDN			-0.209	0.069	-1.578	0.257	-0.335	0.093			-0.008	0.002	0.056	0.016	0.043	0.025
IND	-0.488	0.363	-0.349	0.054	-0.497	0.204	-0.734	0.104	0.001	0.036	-0.010	0.002	-0.029	0.019	0.019	0.010
IRL	0.826	1.669	0.516	0.042	0.546	0.067	0.667	0.074	0.132	1.580	0.007	0.001	0.024	0.004	0.014	0.009
ISR	0.268	0.703	0.041	0.069	0.665	0.094	0.126	0.071	-0.030	0.065	0.017	0.007	-0.033	0.010	-0.042	0.011
ITA	0.162	0.327	0.287	0.040	0.447	0.138	0.800	0.115	-0.025	0.064	-0.006	0.000	-0.018	0.008	-0.007	0.001
JPN	0.530	0.425	0.269	0.013	0.697	0.267	0.193	0.154	-0.002	0.072	0.007	0.001	-0.043	0.011	-0.014	0.003
KOR	-0.438	1.294	0.017	0.070	-0.445	0.058	0.675	0.451	0.017	0.059	-0.007	0.001	0.066	0.016	-0.098	0.049
MAR							-0.719	0.056							0.094	0.037
MEX	-0.398	0.062	-0.216	0.007	-0.193	0.067	-0.856	0.266	-0.015	0.178	-0.016	0.005	0.005	0.002	0.016	0.014
MYS			-0.479	0.094	-1.661	0.304	0.190	0.203			0.026	0.007	0.178	0.056	-0.009	0.011
NLD	0.282	2.390	0.128	0.023	0.598	0.013	-0.180	0.369	-0.008	0.075	0.002	0.001	-0.033	0.004	0.017	0.014
NOR	0.240	0.231	0.176	0.040	0.307	0.129			-0.033	0.142	0.003	0.002	0.011	0.008		
NZL			-0.014	0.042	0.270	0.133					-0.014	0.001	-0.071	0.013		
PAK			-0.215	0.158			-0.711	0.131			-0.010	0.001			0.032	0.012
PHL			-0.424	0.081	-1.628	0.283	-0.186	0.112			-0.007	0.002	0.143	0.038	0.023	0.013
POL			-0.342	0.036	-0.638	0.071	-0.960	0.120			0.006	0.006	-0.018	0.017	0.063	0.009
PRT			0.068	0.014	-0.733	0.193	0.730	0.397			0.000	0.001	0.006	0.001	-0.029	0.030
ROM							-1.016	0.067							0.123	0.043
SGP			-0.374	0.250	1.123	0.477	-1.171	0.656			0.044	0.013	0.057	0.017	0.033	0.027
SWE	0.394	0.091	0.416	0.075	1.451	0.156	-0.055	0.341	-0.012	0.004	0.006	0.000	-0.055	0.004	0.018	0.010
THA	-0.873	2.562	-0.620	0.093	-1.559	0.298	0.492	0.509	0.021	0.007	0.005	0.004	0.065	0.023	-0.016	0.007
TUR			-0.150	0.017	-1.026	0.241	-0.376	0.038			-0.003	0.000	0.047	0.006	0.029	0.015
TWN	-0.326	1.510	-0.108	0.097	-0.461	0.114	1.357	0.965	-0.022	0.059	-0.009	0.002	0.044	0.010	-0.146	0.075
ZAF				0.034		0.177	-1.230	0.231			0.019	0.003	0.023	0.006	0.012	0.004
		alla a la co			-	_	nd time t		- 001.0		on of o		(27) role			

Notes: Columns display estimated quality fixed effect and time trend from 2SLS estimation of equation (37) relative to their respective means across all countries in the sample. Standard errors are heteroskedasticity-robust and adjusted for clustering at the country level. "." indicates country does not appear in sample.

Table 3: Quality Index Intercepts and Slopes, by Manufacturing Industry

Country         Coeff         StdErr         Coeff
ARG         .         .         -0.684         0.134         -0.607         0.097         .         .         -0.020         0.023         -0.008         0.002           AUS         -0.338         0.214         0.165         0.170         0.098         0.184         0.009         0.005         -0.013         0.001         -0.010         0.002           AUT         0.519         0.062         0.429         0.236         0.473         0.174         -0.024         0.005         0.019         0.001         0.004         0.001           BEL         0.797         0.357         0.501         0.268         0.433         0.044         -0.022         0.012         0.024         0.009         0.003           BRA         -0.279         0.039         -0.521         0.151         -0.381         0.089         -0.003         0.011         -0.023         0.004         -0.015         0.003           CAN         -0.387         0.199         -0.020         0.187         -0.126         0.190         0.005         0.004         -0.005         0.004         -0.001         0.003           CHE         0.668         0.054         0.687         0.306         0.630         0.220
AUS         -0.338         0.214         0.165         0.170         0.098         0.184         0.009         0.005         -0.013         0.001         -0.010         0.002           AUT         0.519         0.062         0.429         0.236         0.473         0.174         -0.024         0.005         0.019         0.001         0.004         0.001           BEL         0.797         0.357         0.501         0.268         0.433         0.044         -0.022         0.012         0.024         0.009         0.009         0.003           BRA         -0.279         0.039         -0.521         0.151         -0.381         0.089         -0.003         0.011         -0.023         0.004         -0.015         0.003           CAN         -0.387         0.199         -0.020         0.187         -0.126         0.190         0.005         0.004         -0.005         0.004         -0.005         0.003         -0.011         0.003           CHE         0.668         0.054         0.687         0.306         0.630         0.220         0.005         0.008         0.017         0.004         -0.001         0.004           CHN         -0.531         0.066
AUT 0.519 0.062 0.429 0.236 0.473 0.174 -0.024 0.005 0.019 0.001 0.004 0.001 BEL 0.797 0.357 0.501 0.268 0.433 0.044 -0.022 0.012 0.024 0.009 0.009 0.003 BRA -0.279 0.039 -0.521 0.151 -0.381 0.089 -0.003 0.011 -0.023 0.004 -0.015 0.003 CH 0.687 0.199 -0.020 0.187 -0.126 0.190 0.005 0.004 -0.005 0.003 -0.001 0.003 CH 0.687 0.306 0.306 0.309 0.220 0.005 0.004 0.007 0.003 0.017 0.004 0.005 0.004 CH 0.075 0.003 0.004 CH 0.075 0.003 0.004 0.005 0.004 0.005 0.004 0.005 0.004 0.005 0.004 0.005 0.004 0.005 0.004 0.005 0.004 0.005 0.004 0.005 0.004 0.005 0.004 0.005 0.004 0.005 0.004 0.005 0.004 0.005 0.005 0.004 0.005
BEL         0.797         0.357         0.501         0.268         0.433         0.044         -0.022         0.012         0.024         0.009         0.009         0.003           BRA         -0.279         0.039         -0.521         0.151         -0.381         0.089         -0.003         0.011         -0.023         0.004         -0.015         0.003           CAN         -0.387         0.199         -0.020         0.187         -0.126         0.190         0.005         0.004         -0.005         0.003         -0.001         0.003           CHL         0.668         0.054         0.687         0.306         0.630         0.220         0.005         0.008         0.017         0.004         -0.013         0.004           CHN         -0.531         0.066         0.039         0.284         0.104         0.298         -0.007         0.007         0.003         0.002         -0.002         0.003           COL         -0.421         0.038         -0.401         0.026         -0.370         0.004         -0.001         0.029         -0.029         -0.009         0.003         -0.016         0.007           DEU         0.335         0.049         0.766
BRA         -0.279         0.039         -0.521         0.151         -0.381         0.089         -0.003         0.011         -0.023         0.004         -0.015         0.003           CAN         -0.387         0.199         -0.020         0.187         -0.126         0.190         0.005         0.004         -0.005         0.003         -0.001         0.003           CHE         0.668         0.054         0.687         0.306         0.630         0.220         0.005         0.008         0.017         0.004         0.013         0.004           CHL         -         -         -         0.775         0.155         -0.809         0.187         -         -         0.038         0.009         0.004         0.004         0.003         0.004         0.004         0.004         0.017         0.004         0.013         0.004           CHL         -         -         -         0.155         -0.809         0.187         -         -         0.038         0.009         0.028         0.003           CHL         -         0.053         0.0284         0.104         0.298         -0.007         0.007         0.003         0.002         -0.002         0.003
CAN       -0.387       0.199       -0.020       0.187       -0.126       0.190       0.005       0.004       -0.005       0.003       -0.001       0.003         CHE       0.668       0.054       0.687       0.306       0.630       0.220       0.005       0.008       0.017       0.004       0.013       0.004         CHL       .       .       -0.775       0.155       -0.809       0.187       .       .       0.038       0.009       0.028       0.005         CHN       -0.531       0.066       0.039       0.284       0.104       0.298       -0.007       0.007       0.003       0.002       -0.002       0.003         COL       -0.421       0.038       -0.401       0.026       -0.370       0.004       -0.001       0.029       -0.009       0.003       -0.016       0.007         DEU       0.335       0.049       0.766       0.255       0.568       0.182       -0.011       0.005       -0.029       0.004       -0.026       0.003
CHE     0.668     0.054     0.687     0.306     0.630     0.220     0.005     0.008     0.017     0.004     0.013     0.004       CHL     .     .     -0.775     0.155     -0.809     0.187     .     .     0.038     0.009     0.028     0.005       CHN     -0.531     0.066     0.039     0.284     0.104     0.298     -0.007     0.007     0.003     0.002     -0.002     0.003       COL     -0.421     0.038     -0.401     0.026     -0.370     0.004     -0.001     0.029     -0.009     0.003     -0.016     0.007       DEU     0.335     0.049     0.766     0.255     0.568     0.182     -0.011     0.005     -0.029     0.004     -0.026     0.003
CHL         .         -0.775         0.155         -0.809         0.187         .         .         0.038         0.009         0.028         0.005           CHN         -0.531         0.066         0.039         0.284         0.104         0.298         -0.007         0.007         0.003         0.002         -0.002         0.003           COL         -0.421         0.038         -0.401         0.026         -0.370         0.004         -0.001         0.029         -0.009         0.003         -0.016         0.007           DEU         0.335         0.049         0.766         0.255         0.568         0.182         -0.011         0.005         -0.029         0.004         -0.029         -0.012         0.026         0.003
CHN -0.531 0.066 0.039 0.284 0.104 0.298 -0.007 0.007 0.003 0.002 -0.002 0.003 COL -0.421 0.038 -0.401 0.026 -0.370 0.004 -0.001 0.029 -0.009 0.003 -0.016 0.007 DEU 0.335 0.049 0.766 0.255 0.568 0.182 -0.011 0.005 -0.029 0.004 -0.026 0.003
COL -0.421 0.038 -0.401 0.026 -0.370 0.004 -0.001 0.029 -0.009 0.003 -0.016 0.007 DEU 0.335 0.049 0.766 0.255 0.568 0.182 -0.011 0.005 -0.029 0.004 -0.026 0.003
DEU 0.335 0.049 0.766 0.255 0.568 0.182 -0.011 0.005 -0.029 0.004 -0.026 0.003
DNK   .   0.231 0.151   .   .   0.025 0.002
ESP -0.037 0.107 0.401 0.181 0.155 0.146 -0.009 0.003 -0.027 0.001 -0.014 0.002
FIN
FRA 0.507 0.094 0.736 0.185 0.717 0.144 -0.009 0.002 -0.011 0.001 -0.013 0.001
GBR 0.264 0.154 0.314 0.187 0.286 0.167 -0.002 0.002 -0.023 0.002 -0.014 0.001
GRC  -0.298 0.075  -0.436 0.020     0.017 0.013   0.016 0.006
HKG -1.466 0.776 2.288 1.376 1.373 0.805 0.073 0.056 -0.143 0.076 -0.080 0.038
HUN  -0.351 0.040  -0.497 0.057     0.055 0.003   0.038 0.004
IDN -0.173 0.101 -0.341 0.062 -0.198 0.129 -0.014 0.009 0.015 0.011 0.018 0.012
IND -0.355 0.211 -0.637 0.043 -0.448 0.098   0.014 0.006   0.008 0.006   0.011 0.006
IRL 0.080 0.112 -0.029 0.232 -0.019 0.190 0.002 0.005 0.005 0.001 0.008 0.001
ISR -0.485 0.255 0.086 0.041 -0.040 0.093 0.026 0.008 -0.041 0.009 -0.028 0.004
ITA 0.521 0.020 0.742 0.037 0.784 0.009 -0.001 0.001 -0.006 0.001 -0.006 0.002
JPN 0.070 0.079 0.278 0.181 0.247 0.134 0.002 0.004 -0.001 0.001 0.001 0.001
KOR 0.543 0.418 0.377 0.224 0.629 0.350 -0.015 0.004 -0.071 0.026 -0.063 0.021
MAR  -0.490 0.060  -0.449 0.075     0.110 0.048   0.038 0.007
MEX -0.421 0.086 -0.746 0.175 -0.666 0.133 -0.029 0.015 0.006 0.012 -0.003 0.005
MYS -1.071 0.420 0.217 0.242 0.014 0.139 0.033 0.030 -0.026 0.006 -0.009 0.003
NLD 0.401 0.137   0.368 0.218   0.003 0.005     -0.006 0.008
NOR
NZL
PAK 2.092 1.792 -0.573 0.184 0.621 0.806 -0.002 0.004 0.020 0.010 0.019 0.011
PHL -1.045 0.402 -0.278 0.075 -0.487 0.055 -0.040 0.005 0.026 0.018 0.014 0.013
POL  -0.858 0.057  -0.888 0.079     0.062 0.005   0.041 0.004
PRT -0.317 0.202 0.799 0.391 0.592 0.255 0.028 0.004 -0.028 0.026 -0.017 0.017
ROM  -1.217 0.046  -1.174 0.024     0.157 0.055   0.072 0.006
SGP  -0.142 0.013  -0.601 0.256    -0.041 0.014   0.003 0.011
SWE 0.275 0.152 0.448 0.265 0.334 0.227 0.024 0.001 -0.027 0.005 0.019 0.006
THA -0.481 0.045 0.256 0.308 0.187 0.252 -0.020 0.003 -0.022 0.007 -0.019 0.004
TUR -0.064 0.086 -0.136 0.154 -0.055 0.179   0.000 0.002   0.031 0.020   0.031 0.017
TWN 0.877 0.756 0.070 0.151 0.524 0.393 -0.019 0.006 -0.053 0.018 -0.056 0.019
ZAF -0.077 0.242 -1.104 0.150 -1.055 0.143 0.006 0.008 0.006 0.004 0.006 0.003

Notes: Columns display estimated quality fixed effect and time trend from 2SLS estimation of equation (37) relative to their respective means across all countries in the sample. Standard errors are heteroskedasticity-robust and adjusted for clustering at the country level. "." indicates country does not appear in sample.

Table 4: Quality Index Intercepts and Slopes for Apparel and Textiles